

International Journal of Education & the Arts

Editors

Tawnya Smith
Boston University

Kelly Bylica
Boston University

Jeanmarie Higgins
The Pennsylvania State University

Rose Martin
Norwegian University of Science and Technology

Merel Visse
Drew University

<http://www.ijea.org/>

ISSN: 1529-8094

Volume 23 Number 16

December 9, 2022

What's Up with Aural Training Using WhatsApp: Enhancing Student Well-Being Amidst Mobile Learning Obstacles

Sonja Cruywagen
University of Pretoria, South Africa

Debra Joubert
North-West University, South Africa

Hester Rhoodie
University of Pretoria, South Africa

Citation: Cruywagen, S., Joubert, D., & Rhoodie, H. (2022). What's up with aural training using WhatsApp: Enhancing student well-being amidst mobile learning obstacles. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 23(16).
<http://doi.org/10.26209/ijea23n16>

Abstract

The tertiary aural training environment provides a foundation for music students to understand, learn, and experience music through live interaction between lecturer and student. During the COVID-19 pandemic, the aural training lecturer at our university was compelled to move classes to an online platform accessible to all students, namely WhatsApp. This qualitative case study was conducted in 2020 to understand

better whether aural training students experienced well-being during mobile teaching and learning amid the COVID-19 pandemic. In the WhatsApp aural training environment, there was a lack of immediate aural transmission, and the lecturer was unable to assess students' instantaneous aural skills development. There were 11 participants representing two-year groups in this qualitative study. The participants were five first-year and six second-year music students who attended online aural training classes during the COVID-19 pandemic. The lecturer shared module content with students through WhatsApp using videos, voice recordings, and audio-visual material. Research data were collected through individual online interviews, WhatsApp voice and video recordings, and images. Thematic analyses revealed that the lecturer was able to facilitate an accessible online aural learning environment which enhanced the students' sense of belonging within their smaller groups, although not necessarily within the group as a whole. The students perceived the environment as inclusive, and—as they all had to endure similar circumstances—they were strengthened by a sense of compassion, togetherness, and understanding.

Introduction

Within a time span of two months, teaching and learning at our tertiary institution in South Africa¹ were transformed from in-person classes to operating exclusively online. Music performances, ensemble practices, group classes, and one-on-one practical instrumental or vocal classes that were usually integral to the music students' teaching and learning environment were suspended for a while and then continued online. The sudden change in teaching and learning environments globally caused lecturers and students to think “outside-the-box, outside-the-classroom, and outside-the-physical boundaries of campus” (White & Ruth-Sahd, 2020, p. 294). Burns et al. (2020) explain that during the COVID-19 pandemic, the transition to online learning presented uncertainties to both lecturers and students. Moving to a remote learning environment meant that subject management, learning environments, tools, content, and assessments were only available online (Ali, 2020).

Most online staff meeting discussions resulted in feedback on staff and student challenges, and the authors realised that the subject most debilitated was aural training. Under normal face-to-face circumstances, aural training classes require musical activities that test audiation through individual and group performances (Dalby, 1999; Gordon, 2012), and one key to successful audiation is an immediate response from the lecturer followed by correction from

¹ Our study was conducted during the COVID-19 pandemic in 2020. The first and third authors are faculty members in the music department at the site where the study was conducted.

the student (Clauhs, 2018). To accommodate immediate online interaction between lecturer and students, video conference applications such as Google Meet and Blackboard Collaborate were available, but in South Africa (the site of this study), limited internet access hindered successful online collaboration through video conferencing platforms. The limited internet connectivity (Gumede & Badriparsad, 2022; Motala & Menon, 2020) in many areas (location and contention ratio influences) compelled lecturers to use alternative ways of teaching. The available platform all participants in this study could afford and had access to, was the mobile application WhatsApp². Krotov (2015) explains that mobile learning environments are “interactive, ‘anywhere, anytime’, condensed, compartmentalized, and contextualized,” and support learning in new ways (p. 107). Instant communication through WhatsApp allows for the easy distribution of quality learning material, group interaction (students and instructor), problem-solving discussions, and learning activities that increase critical thinking skills (Zulkanain et al., 2020). For this reason, WhatsApp was used as it enabled the aural training lecturer and students to communicate and share multimedia content. Unfortunately, immediate interaction, as required for successful aural training, could not be achieved using WhatsApp. According to Butnaru et al. (2021), a lack of direct interaction between lecturers and students reduced students’ well-being. Therefore, in our study, the aural training lecturer, as facilitator and guide, had to pursue a learning environment that not only added value to the development of students’ aural skills but also concurrently contributed to their sense of well-being. As a result, we conducted this case study to understand better whether students experienced well-being in their mobile aural training teaching and learning environment.

Literature Review

Under normal circumstances, attending a higher education institution involves more than merely acquiring an academic education. In a study by Cheng (2004), New York students expressed their eagerness for a sense of campus community to freely share their individuality and celebrate academic and social life. Factors that generate stress amongst tertiary students originate from the subject of study or the environment (Kauts, 2016). The standard of undergraduate training in music remains demanding throughout the first two years of study, and music students tend to experience psychological and physical suffering (Burland & Pitts, 2007; Gaunt, 2011; Panebianco, 2017; Spahn et al., 2017). Indeed, music students often endure more psychological stressors than students from other disciplines (Parui & Ghosh, 2017).

² WhatsApp is a mobile application (free to download) used on mobile devices such as smartphones, tablets, computers, and wearable devices (Grant, 2019). The application allows the user to send and receive text and voice messages, multimedia content, and voice and video calls with an active internet connection using Wi-Fi or mobile data (Dove, 2022).

The nationwide lockdown in South Africa (from March 26 to April 16, 2020) forced students to evacuate campuses and return to their homes, where they had to study and concentrate on online lectures “in home environments that were not conducive to work” (Landa et al., 2021, p. 174). When the learning environment changed from face-to-face to online, individual students were confronted with various challenges (Kemp & Grieve, 2014; Mpungose, 2020) and may have experienced the transition quite differently. White and Ruth-Sahd (2020) maintain that of the various challenges, “[p]erhaps most challenging of all, however, were the emotional ones. Labile emotions such as fear, anger, anxiety, and frustration led to emotional exhaustion and difficulty adjusting to the current life and educational circumstances” (p. 294).

In a study by Mulrooney and Kelly (2020), students revealed that they experienced a reduction in their sense of belonging since all teaching and learning was moved online. The correlation between the belonging needs of university students and well-being was investigated by Karaman and Tarim (2018) who confirmed that feeling a sense of belonging influenced students’ well-being. The effect of the online environment on students’ well-being amid the absence of traditional support networks during the COVID-19 pandemic has been the focus of several research studies (Da Silva, 2020; Thomas, 2020; Zhai & Du, 2020). Dodge et al. (2012) researched various theoretical perspectives, attributes, and definitions of well-being (Diener & Ryan, 2009; McNaught, 2011; Seligman, 2011), and proposed a new definition of well-being as a multidimensional social construct which is “the balance point between an individual’s resource pool and the challenges faced” (pp. 229–230). During the global pandemic, student well-being was examined by Burns et al. (2020) with specific reference to the psychosocial effects, and they found that students’ perceived view of their competencies and capabilities either strengthened or worsened their well-being.

The impact of focussing on healthy interpersonal relationships while teaching music is that students learn to appreciate musicking³ as an art and flourish as compassionate individuals (Steele Royston, 2017). Well-being and compassionate teaching are connected and can inspire students to create meaningful lives (Hendricks, 2018; Shairer, 2016). According to Shairer (2016), “compassion seems to buffer the effects of stress” (p. 208), and White and Ruth-Sahd (2020) maintain that compassionate teaching approaches can change students’ perspectives on academic life.

³ Musicking is a term coined by Small (1998). Boyce-Tillman (2016) explains the term ‘musicking’ as “a verb that encompasses all musical activity from composing to performing to listening-in-audience to singing in the shower” (pp. 3-4).

Research Design and Methods

The research design for this study was a case study, which entails an in-depth analysis of a particular research problem within a real-life context (Yin, 2014). Our case study was conducted to explore whether aural training students experienced well-being during mobile teaching and learning amid the COVID-19 pandemic. Our participants (Table 1) were first- and second-year music students enrolled in the 2020 Bachelor of Music (BMus)⁴ programme. They volunteered to participate in this study and were chosen through purposeful sampling (Creswell & Poth, 2018). This case was bounded (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016) by time, namely, two lectures a week during the 2020 lockdown (22 weeks in total); place, which is WhatsApp (one WhatsApp group respectively for BMus I and BMus II students); and activity, that focused on aural development—including sharing WhatsApp text and voice messages, voice calls, and all audio-visual material. The five first-year participants shared valuable experiences to explain the WhatsApp environment. In 2020 they only had six weeks of contact classes, during which this module covered the introduction to performance-based core aspects including the singing of scales in canon, two-part intervals, and three and four part harmonic chords. The rest of the academic year (22 weeks) continued online where the students could only sing in canon with WhatsApp audio examples. Singing in three or four vocal parts was not possible. Only after these students returned to campus in 2021 were they able to participate in the holistic sound experience and performance of all three and four part harmonic material. The six second-year music students who volunteered experienced precisely the opposite. Their first-year aural training (2019) focused on the Gordon and Kodaly performance-based aural training methodology, and they used the online learning environment only in their second year (2020).

Table 1

Meet our participants

2020 First-year students
Rose , choral conductor and classical singer ⁵
Luna , choral conductor, classical and jazz singer
Shaylan , classical singer
Regina , classical singer and music philosopher
Anna , classical singer, composer and aspiring music therapist
2020 Second-year students

⁴ The Bachelor of Music is the most common type of music degree that is offered at conservatories and music schools or departments at universities worldwide (Lipman, n.d.). The following acronyms are used to indicate the different year groups in our study: BMus I (first year) BMus II (second year).

⁵ Classical singers receive training in Western classical vocal music

Isabel, classical singer

Lisa, pianist and composer

Marshall, classical singer and composer

Emily, soloist (viola), violinist and ensemble player

Barry, choral conductor and contemporary drummer

John, symphony orchestra percussionist and violinist. He values music education.

In our study, the applied aural teaching and learning approach originated from Gordon's (1999) framework for audiation development and music learning theory. Gordon broadly defines audiation as the ability to "think" in music and explains that "audiation is to music what thought is to language" (Gordon, 1991). Although Choksy (2001), Jacobi (2012), and Szőnyi (1973) are not Gordon (1991, 1999) scholars, they support his ideas on audiation and have referred to this phenomenon as the ability to internally hear written notation without sound being physically present. Gordon (1991) mentions several educational theorists who influenced the development of his theory, such as Heinrich Pestalozzi, Zoltán Kodály, Carl Orff, Émile Jaques-Dalcroze and Sini'chi Suzuki, who applied similar sequencing principles in their methodologies. Gordon (2012) believes in aural-to-oral transmission as the initial step in facilitating audiation, followed by notation and theory only once these various steps have been achieved, and provides an outline of the skill learning sequences necessary to facilitate audiation and thereby learn and understand music.

Research data were collected through WhatsApp (including messages and videos with learning content, students' homework, lecturer/student feedback⁶, and individual, semi-structured online interviews). Analysis of WhatsApp communication⁷ revealed how the lecturer communicated with the aural training students. The 20-30 minute interviews⁸ (one interview per participant) were conducted online as a result of the legal restrictions and safety measures introduced during the COVID-19 pandemic (Self, 2021). Open-ended questions were used to guide participants to provide information in their own words (Ruel, 2019) and allow participants to clarify and elaborate on their answers (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). To ensure anonymity throughout the analysis, the researchers transcribed the interviews using pseudonyms that participants chose. Data analysis processes included thematic data analysis

⁶ The WhatsApp data was provided by the aural training lecturer, the third author. The aural training lecturer was not involved in data analysis and discussion of the findings.

⁷ Data analysis of WhatsApp communication, transcribing interviews, and discussion of the findings were performed by the first and second authors.

⁸ The first author, the music education lecturer, conducted the interviews to avoid bias. The first and second authors transcribed the interviews and analyzed the data to discuss the findings.

and interpretation (Saldaña, 2013). The data describing the learning environment were analysed to explore if teaching with compassion as a meaning-making process was realised. The data were categorised, and the themes that emerged described the participants' experience of well-being when the learning environment comprised solely of mobile teaching and learning activities. Approval for conducting this study was received from the Research Ethics Committee of the Faculty of Humanities at the university where this study was undertaken.

Theoretical Framework

Individuals experience well-being “when [they] have the psychological, social and physical resources they need to meet a particular psychological, social and/or physical challenge” (Dodge et al., 2012, p. 230). Barkham et al. (2019) define the well-being of students as their personal inner strength and positive emotions that enable them to manage day-to-day challenges during their academic journey. In an educational context, feelings of connectedness and belonging can enhance students' psychological well-being (Allen & Bowles, 2012). Peacock et al. (2020) investigated how online students experienced a sense of belonging within their postgraduate studies and identified three themes that encouraged belonging: lecturer support, meaningful group and peer interactions, and a culture of learning. A mutual focus of attention and a shared mood also enhance feelings of interconnectedness and belonging within a creative music learning community (Cruywagen & Joubert, 2021).

Lecturers would do well to strive to support student well-being through “good pedagogic practice” (Hughes & Spanner, 2019, p. 28) that enables students to “fully exercise their cognitive, emotional, physical and social powers, leading to flourishing” (p. 9). Good pedagogic music practice requires teachers and students to work side-by-side in a collective place called “humanity” (Hendricks, 2018, p. 3). Educators must guide and facilitate students through compassionate teaching that motivates and shares goals and values of musical and educational excellence (Hendricks, 2018). Cultivating compassion-based initiatives in higher education environments can positively affect students' mental state and well-being (Bunting & Hill, 2021; Gilbert, 2016; Gilbert et al., 2018; Jones et al., 2021; Maratos et al., 2019). Hendricks' (2018) qualities of a compassionate music teaching approach are most relevant to the aims of this study: “A dedicated music educator should be able to connect, inspire, guide and motivate every student through a teaching approach that reflects the qualities of compassion such as trust, empathy, patience, inclusion, community and authentic connection” (p. 8).

Findings and discussion

Drawing on the scholarly literature and a thematic analysis of the data collected, the results of this study facilitated a richer understanding of the well-being of the aural training students

using WhatsApp as a learning tool during the COVID-19 pandemic. The following themes emerged from the analysed data: (a) compassionate teaching, (b) student well-being, and (c) the mobile learning environment.

Compassionate Teaching

It is the task of music educators to tailor and focus their teaching approach to help music students “flourish” as well-rounded individuals and musicians (Cruywagen, 2018). Steele Royston (2017) describes the interpersonal attitudes music students appreciate from their music teachers: receptiveness, trust, a sense of humour, an appreciation of students for who they are, willingness to listen to students’ ideas, and enthusiasm for the subject. Our study aligns with Steele Royston’s (2017) description of interpersonal attitudes in that behaviours that participants experienced from the aural lecturer were: an understanding of the COVID-19 pandemic learning environment challenges, trust, an appreciation of student contributions, willingness to help, and a passion for the subject. The challenges of the unfamiliar mobile learning environment induced shared experiences between the aural training lecturer and students, which resulted in mutual respect, trust, and affection. As two participants describe:

- “I see colours in people. Every person has a colour, and it depends on the mood of the person, the shade change, but [I see] mostly the natural colour closer to the core. In Dr Pentatonic⁹, I see a dark green, like a forest green, something that you can trust and lie in and be safe.” (Rose)
- “She’s amazing.” (Isabel)

The lecturer’s presence as an instructor may assist in improving the “quantity and quality of students’ participation” (Alenazi, 2018, pp. 6–7). Isabel noted that “her help helped me too.” Lisa added, “If she realised you can’t do better, she won’t push you unnecessarily, but she still motivated you to become better than you are.” In this study, the lecturer assigned the lecture topic, shared audio and notation examples, provided feedback on students’ voice and video examples, and supplied extra lectures when necessary. Participants felt that the aural lecturer included them in the learning process. Rose explained, “I always got feedback, so I always felt important, like I was there for a reason; so I always felt like I was home.” Dr Pentatonic’s patience was appreciated, and for this reason, she induced care and compassion from the students’ side. Marshall reasoned, “I could empathise with the situation as it was quite difficult. She’s also got a personal life. I can’t just assume that she’s there to help 24/7 and to focus on us solely. So I could empathise with that if I was in that same situation.” Lisa also took piano lessons from the aural lecturer. Their student-lecturer relationship made it possible for her to better understand the lecturer’s emotional fatigue due to the drastic increase in

⁹ Pseudonym chosen by the current aural training students

workload. Lisa observed, “and I personally think that that must’ve taken a toll on her.” Before COVID-19, the time spent on in-class lectures included preparation and immediate feedback during aural activities and usually consisted of four to six hours per week per group. During the COVID-19 pandemic, preparation, listening to assignments, recording of individual feedback, and extra lectures for each group devoured between 16-24 hours per week.

Participants agreed that they trusted and respected the lecturer because she was experienced and was a credible source of information. Marshall commented that Dr Pentatonic’s love and enthusiasm for the subject were highly evident. The students recognised the lecturer’s input and desire to help when they were struggling. Although Emily experienced the lecturer as “strict and sometimes quite intimidating” because of her skill, she found her always extremely fair. Barry echoed, “I never heard her making a mistake.” John entirely trusted Dr Pentatonic’s competence because “she’s a doctor; she knows what she’s doing.” The participants also agreed that the lecturer motivated them to reach their learning goals. Barry acknowledged, “she’s quite caring if you don’t get something right. She will spend almost two hours just trying to teach you and trying to make sure that you get it right.” Participants explained that Dr Pentatonic genuinely wished for everyone in the class to succeed and understand the work. John observed, “She’s very quick to say that you got it right.” He also exclaimed, “There’s one line that I wouldn’t forget that doctor really liked to say: sing in the shower, sing in the shower, sing in the shower! That’s motivating.”

Compassionate teaching comes alive when a lecturer motivates, inspires, and connects with the students (Hendricks, 2018). Our participants were inspired and motivated to reach their full potential in aural training by Dr Pentatonic’s enthusiasm, skill, punctual feedback, and trustworthiness.

Student Well-Being

Increased self-esteem enhances subjective well-being (Padhy et al., 2011). Participants in this study explained that the way the aural training module was instructed added value to their musicianship and contributed to their well-being. The added benefit of developing aural skills to assist musicians in practice is undeniable (Hiatt & Cross, 2006; Johnson, 2013; Rawlins, 2006; Russell, 2017). Participants explained that aural training plays an essential part in becoming a musician. Barry said,

I can talk from the jazz and the more contemporary side – at a gig, they’ll tell you just play (a melody, certain chords) quickly. Call and response is such a big thing in jazz; if you can’t listen to the call, how are you going to respond?

Emily acknowledged that she could directly apply the acquired audiation skills to her instrumental playing. Marshall used the audiation skills to “adjust pitching in our heads.” John, an orchestra member, said, “it betters your musicianship and helps you to listen

critically while performing with others. [It] also helps me a lot in sight-singing and sight-reading.” John always had an excuse to avoid singing in front of aural class members, but he exclaimed that

I’m an instrumentalist, I don’t like singing. Dr Pentatonic encouraged me to sing, so I sing more often now than I used to; which I like. If I could go back, for a third year, it would have been exciting.

Rose shared her delight with aural training as a subject: “It’s difficult. It’s insane. And it’s exciting, but I think that’s what makes it that good.”

Compassionate music teachers share the “goals and values of musical and educational excellence” with their students (Hendricks, 2018, p. 7). Musicking is a celebration of all musical activities where the musicker and the music connect to the experience as a whole (Boyce-Tillman, 2016).

The Mobile Learning Environment

Characteristics of a mobile learning environment summarised by Grant (2019) describe the learner, device, and content as mobile; the lecturer as facilitator and coach as accessible; and engagement with the learning environment as formal, informal, or semi-formal. This description correlates with our study’s aural training learning environment. The student, device, and learning content were mobile, and WhatsApp was used as a teaching and learning tool. The lecturer—as facilitator and coach—was always accessible: John remembered that “When students were struggling, [Dr Pentatonic] made an extra effort to help us” and explained, “Well, that’s just being nice, like just taking [sic] the extra mile for your students.” The lecturer and student engagement with the online aural learning environment were formal, semi-formal, and, from time to time, informal. In the formal WhatsApp learning environment, the aural lecturer shared pre-recorded audio files and notation examples that emphasised a specific aural music skill to be learned in the lesson. The students shared their completed exercises (audio/video files) with the lecturer, and semi-formal and informal feedback was given to all students individually unless most of the group made similar mistakes. In this case, a general feedback video was sent to the applicable WhatsApp group.

Challenges

Students faced many challenges during the COVID-19 pandemic (Landa et al., 2021; Mulrooney & Kelly, 2020; White & Ruth-Sahd, 2020), of which the replacement of in-person learning with online-only teaching was just one (Burns et al., 2020). Using social networking sites such as WhatsApp also had negative consequences, such as technostress, “which refers to the stress individuals experience from their inability to cope with the demands of information technology (IT) use” (Whelan et al., 2022, p. 280).

Three participants expressed their challenges with the online aural learning experience as such:

- When aural classes moved to WhatsApp groups, it was a lot more difficult because we weren't exposed to that class environment. It was just an audio that you needed to listen [to]. I didn't feel motivated. And our grades were dependent on self-study and how you perceived [the content] by yourself. So I think that sense of belonging was missing...I didn't know if I was doing everything correctly or doing anything correctly, so that made it difficult. (Isabel)
- It was quite frustrating because I think your subconscious knows when you record something that you can record it again; there isn't the same amount of pressure. (Emily)
- Every video kind of felt like an examination. Even though it wasn't, you still felt you were putting yourself out on the line. (Rose)

The online learning environment during the COVID-19 pandemic also challenged students to think outside the box and beyond the limits of life on campus (White & Ruth-Sahd, 2020).

Marshall explained,

I basically turned my room into an office and a place where I could practice easily. So I got rid of my curtains and replaced my tables and things so that it was easier for me to practice every day. And [I] moved my piano and chairs as well.

Inclusion and Belonging

Kovač and Vaala (2021) conclude that “belonging is one of the most important ingredients found in inclusion” (p. 1216), but that inclusion in both social and educational settings should not necessarily be perceived simply as the creation of social bonds. However, they do agree that these two concepts have shared commonalities regarding a basic need to “get closer” (p. 1208) to one another. Although participants noted that compassionate teaching made them feel included in the online learning process, they did not always experience a strong sense of belonging. In our study, Barry explained, “although it is hard to have that sense of community just on a WhatsApp group,” most students felt included in the process because the lecturer sent messages to “everyone, and she followed up with everyone.” Marshall’s willingness to always be available “to help anyone,” gave him “a feeling of belonging to the group.”

John appreciated that his friends supported him throughout the year in the aural training module. He said, “we didn't have classes, and if it wasn't for them [his friends], then I would definitely have felt inferior. I think I would've even failed the module if it wasn't for them.” Lisa explained that many students communicated with each other for support and remembered how the students motivated each other through WhatsApp messages. Being included in a shared online group positively affected some participants as they gained a feeling of

solidarity. John reflected, “I thought, we are all in this together. So let’s make the best of it.” Emily said, “It was comforting to know everybody was in the same position,” while Rose felt less isolated, and Shaylan acknowledged that she did not “feel alone in the whole process.” In the interviews, participants who usually struggled with aural training the most particularly welcomed the collaboration with other group members. This collaboration appeared to increase student self-confidence as Luna described, “it felt good to communicate with people who understood what I was going through.” For Regina, it was reassuring that she was not alone in battling with certain tasks but that her close friends would “get together and try and solve it together.” Aural training as a practice can be challenging (Van Zyl, 2020), and the participants who felt uncomfortable singing in front of their class members commented that they were relieved, and Emily exclaimed that she was even “quite thrilled about the idea of not having to sing in front of anyone.”

Participants noted that online communication also strengthened a sense of compassion, togetherness, and understanding as the students experienced similar feelings, such as loneliness, fear, anxiety, and isolation during the COVID-19 pandemic. They knew that their peers were all in the same situation. Barry commented that “everyone was just kind of on their own,” and Rose remembered, “we went through WhatsApp classes together, but we went through it together apart.” Anna said: “I didn’t feel alone, because it’s not just me.” Shaylan experienced a feeling of empathy with the group because “I also understood that a lot of people had different situations that they needed to deal with.” For Isabel, participation in the online learning environment was so time-consuming that she could not support anybody other than herself: “I think time was just an issue for me. I didn’t have enough time.”

WhatsApp as a learning tool caused participants to experience a disruption in their sense of community. Isabel noted, “I think the main thing for me is you lose connection with people; I don’t like online classes. I struggled to concentrate; sitting in front of a screen for two hours is not very fun.” Emily said, “I did miss singing in class together as a group,” while Barry felt, “I know that, obviously, I do like in-person communication, but, for me, the academics were not too bad.”

The findings of Mulrooney and Kelly’s (2020) study link student engagement positively with a sense of belonging to benefit a sense of community. Students in our study did not always feel a strong sense of belonging when the learning environment moved online. A sense of belonging was created by smaller support groups that motivated and shared mutual difficulties. Barry said, “I never really felt like belonging to the group, but I felt a really good belonging with my four best mates in class.”

Conclusion

The current study suggests that it was still possible to facilitate music aural training compassionately, despite many challenges that included (a) transforming the learning environment from in-person to mobile learning, (b) changing immediate interaction and feedback to asynchronous learning, (c) sharing learning content through WhatsApp messages, and (d) spending extra hours on preparation and feedback. White and Ruth-Sahd (2020) explain that compassionate teaching strategies (i.e., recreating learning spaces, accepting the uncertainty of the COVID-19 pandemic, focussing on the positives, and taking care of self and others) can change the students' perspectives of loss and assist students in re-evaluating academic life.

The productive aural training environment enabled the students to find new ways to be creative, communicate successfully, understand the learning content, and recapitulate shared content. Students trusted the lecturer to give them the skills they needed to become quality musicians. The online learning environment allowed students to remain dedicated to their academic performance by spending more time on achieving aural training learning goals. The students experienced support and patience from the lecturer as she offered guidance and feedback whilst being actively involved in music-making with her students. Her teaching approach reflected the qualities of compassion identified by Hendricks (2018), such as trust, empathy, and inclusion. These acts of compassion encouraged students to feel confident enough to share challenges with her. The study revealed that the accessible online aural learning environment enhanced participants' sense of belonging within their smaller groups, although not necessarily within the larger group. They perceived the environment as sheltered and inclusive, and—as they all had to endure similar circumstances—they were strengthened by a sense of compassion, togetherness, and understanding. Both lecturer and students were passionate about music which, in turn, acted as a “sparkle” that brightened their lives and helped maintain a healthy experience of well-being (Bonneville-Roussy & Vallerand, 2020, p. 266). Despite COVID-19 and the sudden shift to an online-only learning environment, participants experienced a strong sense of motivation, inspiration, success, trust, purpose, and collaboration that enhanced their well-being.

References

- Alenazi, A. A. (2018). WhatsApp Messenger as a learning tool: An investigation of pre-service teachers' learning without instructor presence. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 6(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.11114/jets.v6i1.2684>
- Ali, W. (2020). Online and remote learning in higher education institutes: A necessity in light of COVID-19 pandemic. *Higher Education Studies*, 10(3), 16–25. <https://doi.org/10.5539/hes.v10n3p16>

- Allen, K. A., & Bowles, T. (2012). Belonging as a guiding principle in the education of adolescents. *Australian Journal of Educational and Developmental Psychology*, 12, 108–119. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1002251.pdf>
- Barkham, M., Broglia, E., Dufour, G., Fudge, M., Knowles, L., Percy, A., Turner, A., & Williams, C. (2019). Towards an evidence-base for student well-being and mental health: Definitions, developmental transitions and data sets. *Counselling and Psychotherapy Research*, 19(4), 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.1002/capr.12227>
- Bonneville-Roussy, A., & Vallerand, R. J. (2020). Passion at the heart of musicians' well-being. *Psychology of Music*, 48(2), 266–282. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735618797180>
- Boyce-Tillman, J. (2016). *Experiencing music – restoring the spiritual: Music as well-being*. Peter Lang.
- Bunting, L., & Hill, V. (2021). Relational reflections: How do we nurture belonging in creative higher education? [Special issue]. *Innovative Practice in Higher Education*, 139–165. <http://journals.staffs.ac.uk/index.php/ipihe/article/view/224>
- Burland, K., & Pitts, S. (2007). Becoming a music student investigating the skills and attitudes of students beginning a music degree. *Arts and Humanities in Higher Education*, 6(3), 289–308. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1474022207080847>
- Burns, D., Dagnall, N., & Holt, M. (2020). Assessing the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on student well-being at universities in the United Kingdom: A conceptual analysis. *Frontiers in Education*, 5, Article 582882. <https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2020.582882>
- Butnaru, G. I., Haller, A-P., Dragolea, L-L., Anichiti, A., & Tacu Hârșan, G-D. (2021). Students' wellbeing during transition from onsite to online education: Are there risks arising from social isolation? *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(18), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18189665>
- Cheng, D. X. (2004). Students' sense of campus community: What it means, and what to do about it. *Journal of Student Affairs Research and Practice*, 41(2), 415–433. <https://doi.org/10.2202/1949-6605.1331>
- Choksy, L. (2001). *Teaching music in the twenty-first century*. Prentice Hall.
- Clauhs, M. (2018). Beginning band without a stand: Fostering creative musicianship in early instrumental programs. *Music Educators Journal*, 104(4), 39–47. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432118768383>
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (5th ed.). SAGE.

- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed). SAGE.
- Cruywagen, S. (2018). "Flourishing with music": From music students to well-rounded musicians of the 21st century. *Koers – Bulletin for Christian Scholarship*, 83(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.19108/KOERS.83.1.2306>
- Cruywagen, S., & Joubert, D. (2021). Exploring the "Experience of the Experiencer" in an undergraduate jazz ensemble learning community. In J. Boyce-Tillman, L. van der Merwe & J. Morelli (Eds.), *Ritualised belonging: Musicing and spirituality in the South African context* (pp. 211–230). Peter Lang.
- Dalby, B. (1999). Teaching audiation in instrumental classes: An incremental approach allows teachers new to Gordon's music learning theory to gradually introduce audiation-based instruction to their students. *Music Educators Journal*, 85(6), 22–46. <https://doi.org/10.2307/3399517>
- Da Silva, B. M. (2020). Will virtual teaching continue after the COVID-19 pandemic? *Acta Médica Portuguesa*, 33(6), 440–448. <https://doi.org/10.20344/amp.13970>
- Diener, E., & Ryan, K. (2009). Subjective well-being: A general overview. *South African Journal of Psychology*, 39(4), 391–406. <https://doi.org/10.1177/008124630903900402>
- Dodge, R., Daly, A. P., Huyton, J., & Sanders, L. D. (2012). The challenge of defining well-being. *International Journal of Well-being*, 2(3), 222–235. <https://doi.org/10.5502/ijw.v2i3.4>
- Dove, J. (2022, January 19). *What is WhatsApp?* Digitaltrends. <https://www.digitaltrends.com/mobile/what-is-whatsapp/>
- Gaunt, H. (2011). Understanding the one-to-one relationship in instrumental/vocal tuition in higher education: Comparing student and teacher perceptions. *British Journal of Music Education*, 28(2), 159–179. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051711000052>
- Gilbert, T. (2016). Assess compassion in Higher Education? Why and how would we do that? *LINK*, 2(1). <https://www.herts.ac.uk/link/volume-2,-issue-1/assess-compassion-in-higher-education-how-and-why-would-we-do-that>
- Gilbert, T., Doolan, M., Beka, S., Spencer, N., Crotta, M., & Davari, S. (2018). Compassion on university degree programmes at a UK university: The neuroscience of effective group work. *Journal of Research in Innovative Teaching & Learning*, 11(1), 4–21. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JRIT-09-2017-0020>
- Gordon, E. E. (1991). Sequencing music skills and content. *American Music Teacher*, 41(2), 22–51. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/43538820>

- Gordon, E. E. (1999). All about audiation and music aptitudes: Edwin E. Gordon discusses using audiation and music aptitudes as teaching tools to allow students to reach their full music potential. *Music Educators Journal*, 86(2), 41–44.
<https://doi.org/10.2307/3399589>
- Gordon, E. E. (2012). *Learning sequences in music: A contemporary music learning theory*. GIA Publications.
- Grant, M. M. (2019). Difficulties in defining mobile learning: Analysis, design characteristics, and implications. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 67(1), 361–388.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-018-09641-4>
- Gumede, L., & Badriparsad, N. (2022). Online teaching and learning through the students' eyes—Uncertainty through the COVID-19 lockdown: A qualitative case study in Gauteng province, South Africa. *Radiography*, 28(1), 193-198.
- Heiberg, T., & Winning, A. (2020, March 23). *South Africa to impose 21-day lockdown as coronavirus cases jump*. Reuters. <https://www.reuters.com/article/ushealth-coronavirus-safrica-idUSKBN21A1SZ>
- Hendricks, K. S. (2018). *Compassionate music teaching: A framework for motivation and engagement in the 21st century*. Rowman & Littlefield.
- Hiatt, J. S., & Cross, S. (2006). Teaching and using audiation in classroom instruction and applied lessons with advanced students. *Music Educators Journal*, 92(5), 46–49.
<https://doi.org/10.2307/3878502>
- Hughes, G., & Spanner, L. (2019). *The university mental health charter*. Student Minds.
https://www.studentminds.org.uk/uploads/3/7/8/4/3784584/191208_umhc_artwork.pdf
- Jacobi, B. S. (2012). Kodály, literacy, and the brain: Preparing young music students to read pitch on the staff. *General Music Today*, 25(2), 11–18.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1048371311414182>
- Johnson, E. (2013). Practical tools to foster harmonic understanding. *Music Educators Journal*, 99(3), 63–68. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432112469539>
- Jones, M., Priestley, M., Brewster, L., Wilbraham, S. J., Hughes, G., & Spanner, L. (2021). Student wellbeing and assessment in higher education: The balancing act. *Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education*, 46(3), 438–450.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2020.1782344>
- Karaman, Ö., & Tarim, B. (2018). Investigation of the correlation between belonging needs of students attending university and well-being. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 6(4), 781–788. <https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2018.060422>

- Kauts, D. S. (2016). Emotional intelligence and academic stress among college students. *Educational Quest – An International Journal of Education and Applied Social Sciences*, 7(3), 149–157. <https://doi.org/10.5958/2230-7311.2016.00036.2>
- Kemp, N., & Grieve, R. (2014). Face-to-face or face-to-screen? Undergraduates' opinions and test performance in classroom vs. online learning. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 5, Article 1278. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2014.01278>
- Kovač, V. B., & Vaala, B. L. (2021). Educational inclusion and belonging: A conceptual analysis and implications for practice. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 25(10), 1205–1219. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2019.1603330>
- Krotov, V. (2015). Critical success factors in m-learning: A socio-technical perspective. *Communications of the Association for Information Systems*, 36, 105–126. <https://doi.org/10.17705/1CAIS.03606>
- Landa, N., Zhou, S., & Marongwe, N. (2021). Education in emergencies: Lessons from COVID-19 in South Africa. *International Review of Education*, 67(1), 167–183. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11159-021-09903-z>
- Lipman, S. (n.d.). The 10 different types of Bachelor degrees. *Inside Music Schools*. <https://insidemusicschools.com/2020/03/19/the-10-different-types-of-music-degrees/#:~:text=The%20Bachelor%20of%20Music%20is,performance%2C%20composition%2C%20and%20theory.>
- Maratos, F. A., Gilbert, P., & Gilbert, T. (2019). Improving well-being in higher education: Adopting a compassionate approach. In P. Gibbs, J. Jameson & A. Elwick (Eds.), *Values of the university in a time of uncertainty* (pp. 261–278). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-15970-2_18
- McNaught, A. (2011). Defining well-being. In A. McNaught & A. Knight (Eds.), *Understanding well-being: An introduction for students and practitioners of health and social care* (pp. 7–22). Scion Publishing.
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. Jossey-Bass.
- Motala, S., & Menon, K. (2020). In search of the “new normal”: Reflections on teaching and learning during Covid-19 in a South African university. *Southern African Review of Education*, 26(1), 80–99. <https://hdl.handle.net/10520/ejc-sare-v26-n1-a6>
- Mpungose, C. B. (2020). Emergent transition from face-to-face to online learning in a South African University in the context of the coronavirus pandemic. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 7(1), 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-020-00603-x>

- Mulrooney, H. M., & Kelly, A. F. (2020). COVID-19 and the move to online teaching: Impact on perceptions of belonging in staff and students in a UK widening participation university. *Journal of Applied Learning and Teaching*, 3(2), 17–30. <https://doi.org/10.37074/jalt.2020.3.2.15>
- Padhy, M., Pati, P., Monteiro, S. R. (2021). Well-being indices: A role of mindfulness and social support. *International Journal of Health & Allied Sciences* 10(4), 263–267. https://doi.org/10.4103/ijhas.IJHAS_254_20
- Panebianco, C. (2017). Musculoskeletal and other performance related disorders in South African undergraduate music students. *Journal of Occupational Health and Epidemiology*, 6(2), 61–69. <https://doi.org/10.29252/johe.6.2.61>
- Parui, A., & Ghosh, P. (2017). Does tertiary education in music promote psychological well-being and curb negative emotions. *International Journal of Home science*, 3(3), 37–41. <https://www.homesciencejournal.com/archives/2017/vol3issue3/PartA/3-3-9-610.pdf>
- Peacock, S., Cowan, J., Irvine, L., & Williams, J. (2020). An exploration into the importance of a sense of belonging for online learners. *International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning*, 21(2), 18–35. <https://doi.org/10.19173/irrodl.v20i5.4539>
- Rawlins, R. (2006). Sight singing for instrumentalists. *American Music Teacher*, 55(3), 26–29. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/43548203>
- Ruel, E. (2019). How are open-ended questions coded? In E. Ruel (Ed.), *100 Questions (and answers) about survey research* (pp. 94–96). SAGE. <https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781506348803.n81>
- Russell, H. (2017). A cappella ear training: Bringing theory and aural skills together via singing in a jazz program environment. *Australian Journal of Music Education*, 51(2), 20–28. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1270172.pdf>
- Saldaña, J. (2013). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (2nd ed.). SAGE.
- Self, B. (2021). Conducting interviews during the COVID-19 pandemic and beyond. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 22(3), Article 15. <https://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/3741/4764>
- Seligman, M. E. P. (2011). *Flourish: A visionary new understanding of happiness and well-being*. Free Press.
- Shairer, S. (2016). Enhancing compassion and empathy. In M. J. B. Ludvik (Ed.), *The neuroscience of learning and development: Enhancing creativity, compassion, critical thinking, and peace in higher education* (pp. 194–217). Stylus Publishing.

- Small, C. (1998). *Musicking: The meanings of performing and listening*. Wesleyan University Press.
- Spahn, C., Voltmer, E., Mornell, A., & Nusseck, M. (2017). Health status and preventive health behavior of music students during university education: Merging prior results with new insights from a German multicenter study. *Musicae Scientiae*, 21(2), 213–229. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1029864917698197>
- Steele Royston, N. (2017). Improving music teaching through interpersonal relationships. *Music Educators Journal*, 103(4), 34–39. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432117698023>
- Szönyi, E. (1973). *Kodály's principles in practice: An approach to music education through the Kodály method*. Boosey & Hawkes.
- Thomas, M. (2020). Virtual teaching in the time of COVID-19: Rethinking our WEIRD pedagogical commitments to teacher education. *Frontiers in Education*, 5, Article 95574. <https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2020.595574>
- Van Zyl, S. (2020). *Aural training at a selected tertiary institution in South Africa, 2015–2019: Student perspectives, motivation and problem-solving strategies* [Master's Thesis, University of Cape Town]. <http://hdl.handle.net/11427/33099>
- Whelan, E., Golden, W., & Tarafdar, M. (2022). How technostress and self-control of social networking sites affect academic achievement and wellbeing. *Internet Research*, 32(7), 280–306. <https://doi.org/10.1108/INTR-06-2021-0394>
- White, K. A., & Ruth-Sahd, L. A. (2020). Compassionate teaching strategies amid the COVID-19 pandemic. *Nurse Educator*, 45(6), 294–295. <https://doi.org/10.1097/NNE.0000000000000901>
- Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case study research: Design and methods* (5th ed.). SAGE.
- Zhai, Y., & Du, X. (2020). Addressing collegiate mental health amid COVID-19 pandemic. *Psychiatry Research*, 288, 1–2. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psychres.2020.113003>
- Zulkanain, N. A., Miskon, S., & Abdullah, N. S. (2020). An adapted pedagogical framework in utilizing WhatsApp for learning purpose. *Education and Information Technologies*, 25(4), 2811–2822. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-019-10096-0>

About the Authors

Sonja Cruywagen is a lecturer at the University of Pretoria, South Africa, where she teaches undergraduate courses on the interface of Music Education and Musicology (Popular music). She obtained her Ph.D. in Music from the North-West University (Potchefstroom Campus), South Africa. Her research interests lie in the fields of blended learning in music, learning and teaching from a student-centered perspective, constructing

teaching strategies for musical understanding, and learning through a holistic education approach that develops the student into a well-rounded person. She investigates the demands for teaching music in the 21st century in South Africa to prepare pre-service music teachers for their future careers. This interest led to the creation of an online platform where generalist teachers and specialist music teachers in practice can explore teaching and learning ideas to create music learning experiences that help learners to understand, develop and independently express themselves through music.
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2179-0203>

Debra Joubert is an extraordinary researcher in the research entity Musical Arts in South Africa: Resources and Applications at the School of Music, North-West University. In 2017 she was awarded a PhD degree in music at the North-West University. In her thesis, *Qualitative strategies of inquiry in five music education journals: Recent use and future directions*, she explores the use of qualitative strategies of inquiry in music education articles published in five selected Thomson Reuters Web of Science journals between 2012 and 2015. She was an assistant music researcher at the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) and assisted in postgraduate supervision at the School of Music at the University of Pretoria. Debra Joubert has published articles in *Musicus*, *International Journal of Community Music*, and *International Journal of Music Education*. Her main research interests focus on music and well-being, community music, and research methodology in music education. <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2462-6847>

Tessa Rhodie is currently a full-time lecturer in Piano, Piano methodology, Ensemble studies, and Aural training at the University of Pretoria's School of the Arts: Music Department. She obtained the B Mus and M Mus degrees at the University of Potchefstroom and D Mus (Performance) degree at the University of Pretoria. She received the following Performer's Licentiates in Piano with Distinction: Licentiate of the Trinity College of Music in London, Licentiate of the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music in London, and a Performer's Licentiate of the University of South Africa (UNISA). Her teaching philosophy is focused on student development into well-informed, mindful, and mature musicians and teachers. Rhodie is a performing pianist, and her research areas include piano method, more specifically, foundation technique and tertiary aural training. She published several articles on beginner piano technique and supervised numerous masters and doctoral students in these focused areas. <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1278-7173>

International Journal of Education & the Arts

<http://IJEa.org>

ISSN: 1529-8094

Editor

Tawnya Smith
Boston University

Co-Editors

Kelly Bylica
Boston University

Jeanmarie Higgins
The Pennsylvania State University

Rose Martin
Norwegian University of Science and Technology

Merel Visse
Drew University

Managing Editors

Christine Liao
University of North Carolina Wilmington

Yenju Lin
The Pennsylvania State University

Associate Editors

Betty Bauman
Boston University

Leah Murthy
Boston University

Christina Hanawalt
University of Georgia

Tina Nospal
Boston University

David Johnson
Lund University

Hayon Park
George Mason University

Alexis Kallio
Griffith University

Allyn Phelps
University of Massachusetts Dartmouth

Heather Kaplan
University of Texas El Paso

Tim Smith
Uniarts Helsinki

Elizabeth Kattner
Oakland University

Natalie Schiller
University of Auckland

Allen Legutki
Benedictine University

Deborah (Blair) VanderLinde
Oakland University

Alesha Mehta
University of Auckland

David Zeitner
Nanyang Academy of Fine Arts

Advisory Board

Full List: <http://www.ijea.org/editors.html>

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/).